Comparative Study between Storytelling and English Song to Teach Vocabulary

(An Experimental Research to the Fourth Grade Students of SD Patra Mandiri Cilacap in the Academic Year of 2015/2016)

Angga Fendy Pradana*, Ngadiso and Ambrosius Handoko Pudjobroto

English Education Department, Teacher Training and Education Faculty, Sebelas Maret University

Email: vallevia8@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This article reports the result of a research dealing with, (1) whether there is any significant difference on teaching vocabulary between using Storytelling and using Song and (2) whether the storytelling is more effective than the song to teach vocabulary for the fourth grade students of SD Patra Mandiri Cilacap or not. The samples were two classes namely experimental class taught by using storytelling and control class taught by song. This study used a test (Multiple Choices, Completion, and Pronunciation test) to collect the data. In this research, the writer chose two classes of third grade students of SD Patra Mandiri Cilacap. The sample was taken from the population of fourth grade students. The total samples are 2 classes consisting of 44 students, 22 students of IV B and 22 students of IV A. The results of the study show that, (1) there is a significant difference between storytelling and English song to teach vocabulary and (2) the significant difference indicates that storytelling is effective to be applied to teach vocabulary. Based on the research findings, it could be summarized that storytelling is an effective method in teaching vocabulary at the fourth grade students of SD Patra Mandiri Cilacap in the academic years of 2015/2016.

Keywords: comparative, vocabulary mastery, storytelling, English song

ABSTRAK

Artikel ini melaporkan hasil penelitian yang berhubungan dengan, (1) apakah ada perbedaan yang signifikan pada pengajaran kosakata antara menggunakan cerita dan menggunakan lagu dan (2) apakah cerita ini lebih efektif daripada lagu untuk mengajar kosakata untuk siswa kelas empat dari SD Patra

Kata kunci: komparasi, penguasaan kosakata, cerita, lagu Bahasa Inggris

English is the language that is spoken most in the world, it is originated from British and found all its way around the world. English is used for international conference, trading, advertisement, and even the guide book for the electronic devices that we buy. So, English is important because it connects the people, for instance, when tourist from foreign country comes to Indonesia they often use English as a means of communication no matter from which country they come. In Indonesia there is large scaling use of English in our daily life because of the rapid development of technology and science or global situations. All of that can be classified as information. Human is curious by nature, we always seek information according to our needs. The information can be received via media. The media can be in any form, for example: mass media like newspapers, radio or television. It is a possibility that the information that we are trying to find is not in Indonesian but in English and how we can solve that problem? We can solve the problem using media too. We will find a way to understand the language itself, by translating it using Google translate or opening the dictionary and maybe asking someone who knows English to interpret the information that they need. The information can give us pleasure/entertainment, knowledge/education and many things. From the education, the new development of technology and science can create many media that are usable for teaching the students. So, how will media influence the quality of teaching a foreign language, especially English?
Presently, English is taught at Elementary School. It is a fact that the students may have difficulties in learning English because they cannot grasp the meaning of the word. The teacher tries to teach a completely different language that has different characteristics (Completely different from the mother tongue). That is why media are needed. The media can be the way to create a bridge to make the students understand the words and slowly grasp the meaning. So, in conclusion the media can be used as the teaching tools.

Vocabulary is part of language element, so it is impossible to avoid vocabulary in using language for communication. Vocabulary is one of the most obvious components of language and one of the first things applied linguists turned their attention to. (Jack Richard, 2001: 4) According to Penny Ur (1996: 60) there are some elements that need to be taught in teaching vocabulary; they are form (pronunciation and spelling), grammar, collocation, aspect of meaning, word formation.

Vocabulary is central of language in which it is the biggest component of any language and the success in learning language can be proved by the success in mastering vocabulary. It can be concluded that vocabulary mastery means complete knowledge or great skill of a list of English words that includes the meaning of words, spelling, pronunciation, and the use of words in right context.

The focus of the writer to convey in this research is the way of teaching vocabulary using two media with the elementary students as the subject of the research. The first one is Storytelling and the second one is using song. Both of them are media that are widely known to have a good reputation in dealings with teaching foreign language to the young learners. As the writer mentioned above, the media is used as a teaching tools to create a bridge to make the students know what the teacher wants to explain/teach. The student will not have a blank expression in their face when we are using a (certain) media that is suitable with the condition of the students. Since both of them have a good reputation, which one is better? That is the question that the writer is trying to study.

According to Taylor (2000: p. 16), storytelling is relating tale to one or more listeners through voice and gestures. Oral telling tends to use much simpler
language. Sentences are generally shorter. With oral telling, we usually repeat things more redundancy especially if the students are having difficulty following. Storytelling is motivating and appealing. The activity is classified as a real activity where teacher can use it to create valuable and enjoyable condition for promoting language learning. Wright (1996) states “When children create and tell a story in the foreign language the story and the language become theirs”.

Listening and narrating stories is a familiar procedure for all learners in their mother tongue and it takes several forms. Reporting one’s own stories and personal anecdotes or telling jokes is a fascinating, everyday routine that people enjoy sharing with each other. The universal nature of stories in relation to their content and structure and the cultural elements that they convey make them relevant to the learners’ interest and background. The material is easily found and there is a wide variety of sources. Stories provide a “rich comprehensible input and stimulus for real communication in English” (Rosner, 1988). Their use in the classroom is not a passive process. They are used as a stimulating for further activities that promote purposeful learning within a meaningful, familiar and relaxed context and provide practice in language, social and communication skills. An extremely motivating and fun activity is the retelling of a story by the learners themselves, after it has been presented by the teacher, whereby they are given the chance to use the language for real communication and internalize its aspects while being creative and having fun.

Why storytelling is a good media for teaching vocabulary? (1) most of the new language in stories are perfectly contextualized and it is usually repeated more than once so that the listener has more than one opportunity to understand the meaning. (2) additional information is also given to help learners with the comprehension of the story as with visual aids for example, the introduction of the new words need not be a huge task. (3) the grammatical structures included in the story should be seen mainly as formulaic expression which do not get grammatical analysis but which can be learnt in an ongoing way because they appear frequently in stories in appropriate contexts.

commit to user
Based on the explanation above, storytelling is very helpful in teaching vocabulary to the student. It offers many advantages and can make students understand the language easier. Repetition of word often found in storytelling can help the teacher to teach new words and pronunciation to the students. Stories are perfectly contextualized and it is usually repeated more than once so that the listener has more than one opportunity to understand the meaning. Stories provide

Most children enjoy singing songs, and they can often be a welcome change from the routine of learning a foreign language. For the teacher, using songs in the classroom can also be a nice break from following a set curriculum. Songs can be taught to any number of students and even those teachers with the most limited resources can use them effectively. Songs can play an important role in the development of language in young children learning a language.

One advantage of using songs in the young learner classroom is their flexibility. Songs can be used for a number of purposes and there are many reasons why songs can be considered a valuable pedagogical tool. Songs are useful tool in the learning of vocabulary, sentence structures, and sentence patterns, not to mention their reflectivity of mother tongue culture (Murphey, 1992). Songs can also help young learners improve their listening skills, pronunciation, and speaking skills (Murphey, 1992). Perhaps the greatest benefit to using songs in the classroom is that they can be fun. Pleasure for its own sake is an important part of learning a language, something which is often overlooked by teachers, and songs can add interest to the classroom routine and potentially improve student motivation.

Based on the reasons above, it is clear that both media are good teaching tools for the teacher. This study explores the use of storytelling and song to teach English vocabulary to the children. Hypotheses in this research can be stated based on the review of related literature and rationale. The hypotheses are as follows: Based on the theories underlying the study dealing with using storytelling and song in vocabulary, the hypotheses proposed in this study are: (1) there is a significant difference in vocabulary mastery between the students taught by storytelling method and those taught by song of the fourth grade students of SD
Patra Mandiri Cilacap and (2) the students taught by storytelling have better vocabulary mastery than those taught by the song of the fourth grade students of SD Patra Mandiri Cilacap.

RESEARCH METHODS

This research took place at SD Patra Mandiri, Jalan MT. Haryono Komperta Sidanegara Cilacap, Central Java. It was implemented from early April to early of May 2016. The experimental research was used in the research. The experimental is a research method used to gain certain treatment effect with other in the controlled condition (Sugiyono, 2012: 72).

The researcher decides to apply two methods which were used in two different classes. One class was taught using storytelling and another class was taught using English song.

The researcher used two groups in this research; experimental group and control group. The researcher gave different treatments to the groups; the experimental group was taught by storytelling and the control group was taught by English song. After giving the treatment, the researcher gave post-test to both groups to analyze whether there was significant influence in the experimental group or control group. The scores of the post test were the data to analyze. The population of the research was all the students of IV classes in SD Patra Mandiri Cilacap. There were two classes used in this research: one class was an experimental group (IV A) and another class was a control group (IV B). In the research, researcher used cluster random sampling. The population is all students in grade IV in SD Patra Mandiri Cilacap. Cluster random sampling is a sampling technique when the population is divided into cluster or group and the sample is selected (Sugiyono. 2012: 82). From the two chosen classes, researcher made lottery to decide the experimental group and the control group. The experimental group was taught by storytelling and the control group was taught by English song.
The researcher used test in collecting the data. According to Longman Dictionary (2010: p. 1048) states; “A test is a number of questions to measure someone’s skill, cleverness, or knowledge of a particular subject”. The test is used to measure the students’ vocabulary mastery. In this research, the objective is to test the students’ vocabulary mastery. The tests are needed very much in obtaining the score in order to know the effect of storytelling and English song as the treatment to teach vocabulary.

The post-test was conducted at the end of the experiment or after the treatments. It was used to discover whether the implementation of storytelling and English song as treatment of the research brings some beneficial effects to the students’ vocabulary mastery or not.

The techniques used in analyzing the data were descriptive statistic. The descriptive statistics was used to know the mean, median, mode, standard deviation, histogram, and polygon of students’ score in vocabulary test. The analysis was continued to identify which group is better by using T-test. Before analyzing the data for testing the hypotheses, the researcher analyzed the normality of the data.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

As the requirement of t-test, the data of pre-test need to be tested for similarity, normality, and homogeneity. The similarity in this research is at the level of significance of 0.05 (α = 0.05), the normality test used is Liliefors test at the level of significance of 0.05 (α = 0.05), while the homogeneity test used is Bartlet at the level of significance of 0.05 (α = 0.05).
1. Pre-test Scores

a. Similarity of two classes

The sample used in this research should come from the same level of population and have no significant difference in the vocabulary mastery. To prove that the two groups have no significant difference, the writer used the t-test. Null hypothesis (H₀) states that there is no significant difference in the mastery of vocabulary between the two classes, while the alternative hypothesis (H₁) states that there is a significant difference in the mastery of vocabulary between the two classes. Null hypothesis (H₀) is rejected if t₀ > tₜ (t observation > t table) for degree of freedom df = n₁ + n₂ - 2 and the level of significance α = 0.05. On the contrary, if t₀ < tₜ (t observation < t table), H₀ is accepted.

The result of t computation (t-test) shows that the t observation (t₀) is 0.112 while the t table (tₜ) for degree of freedom 42 and the level of significance 0.05 is 1.960. It can be seen that the t observation (t₀) is lower than the t table (tₜ), which means that the null hypothesis (H₀) is accepted. It can be concluded that there is no significant difference in the mastery of vocabulary between the two classes.

b. Result of Normality Test

Table 1. The result of normality test for experimental and control groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Teaching method</th>
<th>Number of sample</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>L. value</th>
<th>Conclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>L₀</td>
<td>Lₜ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Storytelling</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>0.1615</td>
<td>0.1889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Song</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>0.1023</td>
<td>0.1889</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the table above, it can be concluded that the data of both experimental group and control group are in normal distribution. In the
data of the experimental group, it can be seen that $L_o$ is 0.1615. It is then consulted with L table for $n = 22$ at the level of significance of 0.05 ($\alpha = 0.05$) = 0.1889. Because the value of $L_o$ is lower than L table ($L_o < L_t$), it can be concluded that the data of the experimental group are in normal distribution.

Meanwhile, the data of the control group show that $L_o$ is 0.1023. It is consulted with the L table for $n = 22$ at the level of significance of 0.05 ($\alpha = 0.05$) = 0.1889. Because the value of $L_o$ is lower than L table ($L_o < L_t$), it can be concluded that the data of the control group are in normal distribution.

c. Result of Homogeneity Test

From the computation of homogeneity test of pre-test, it can be seen that $\chi^2 = 0.103$ is lower than $\chi^2_{0.05} = 3.841$ or $\chi^2_o < \chi^2_{0.05}$. Because $\chi^2_o$ is lower than $\chi^2_{0.05}$, it can be concluded that the data are homogeneous.

2. Post-test Scores

a. Result of Normality Test

Table 2. The result of normality test for experimental and control groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Teaching method</th>
<th>Number of sample</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>L. value</th>
<th>Conclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$L_o$</td>
<td>$L_t$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Storytelling</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>0.1679</td>
<td>0.1889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Song</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>0.1315</td>
<td>0.1889</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the table above, it can be concluded that the data of both the experimental group and the control group are in normal distribution. From the data of the experimental group, it can be seen that $L_o$ is 0.1679. It is then consulted with L table for $n = 22$ at the level of significance of 0.05 ($\alpha = 0.05$) = 0.1889. Because the value of $L_o$ is lower than L table
(L_o < L_t), it can be concluded that the data of the experimental group are in normal distribution.

Meanwhile, the data of the control group show that L_o is 0.1315. It is consulted with the L table for n = 22 at the level of significance of 0.05 (α = 0.05) = 0.1889. Because the value of L_o is lower than L table (L_o < L_t), it can be concluded that the data of the control group are in normal distribution.

b. Result of Homogeneity Test

From the computation of homogeneity test of post-test, it can be seen that \( \chi^2 = 0.763 \) is lower than \( \chi^2_t = 3.841 \) or \( \chi^2_o < \chi^2_t \). Because \( \chi^2_o \) is lower than \( \chi^2_t \), it can be concluded that the data are homogeneous.

A. Hypothesis Testing

The hypothesis of this research are as follows: first, there is a significant difference in the achievement of vocabulary mastery between the students taught using storytelling and those taught using song, second, the students taught using storytelling have better mastery than those taught using song.

1. The First Hypothesis

To test the first hypothesis, the writer used t-test formula to analyze the data. The data, which are analyzed in this research, are post-test scores of the two groups, the experimental group and the control group. The following is the procedures to apply t-test.

a. Determining the degree of freedom

\[
\text{df} = n_1 + n_2 - 2 \\
= 22 + 22 - 2 \\
= 42
\]
b. Applying the t-test

Using the t-test formula, the writer tested the null hypothesis ($H_0$) of this research that is there is no significant difference in vocabulary mastery between students taught using storytelling and those taught using song. Statistically, the hypothesis can be formulated as $H_0$ (Null Hypothesis): $\mu_1 = \mu_2$.

The alternative hypothesis ($H_a$) of this research is that there is a significant difference in vocabulary mastery between the students taught using storytelling and those taught using song. Statistically, the hypothesis can be formulated as $H_a$ (Alternative Hypothesis): $\mu_1 \neq \mu_2$. If $t_0$ (t-observation) is smaller than $t_t$ (t-table) or $t_0 < t_t$, $H_0$ is accepted. On the contrary, if $t_0$ (t-observation) is higher than $t_t$ (t-table) or $t_0 > t_t$, $H_0$ is rejected.

The result of t computation shows that t-observation ($t_o$) is 1.994 while the t- table ($t_t$) for the degree of freedom of 42 and the level of significance $\alpha = 0.05$ is 1.960. So, $t_o$ is higher than $t_t$. It means that $H_0$ is rejected. It can be concluded that there is a significant difference in vocabulary mastery between students taught using storytelling and those taught using song.

2. The Second Hypothesis

The second hypothesis of this research is that the students taught using storytelling have better vocabulary mastery than those taught using song. In this case, to test the second hypothesis, the writer needs to compare the post-test mean of the two groups. The mean score of the experimental group is 75.04, while the mean score of control group is 68.91. The mean score of the
experimental group is higher than the mean score of the control group. It can be concluded that storytelling is more effective than song.

B. Discussion

The result of the research shows that there is a significant difference in vocabulary mastery between the students taught using storytelling and those taught using song ($\mu_1 \neq \mu_2$). Storytelling is more effective than song ($\bar{X}_1 > \bar{X}_2$).

The result of analysis can be clarified by the following reasons. It has been explained in chapter II that the method plays an important role in the process of vocabulary mastery of the students. Appropriate method will determine a better result of teaching learning process. In this research, Storytelling and song are compared.

The use of Storytelling is better because teacher won’t find any difficulties in finding and selecting story that are suitable both in terms of vocabulary and topic or theme, because story is easier to create than a song. Storytelling uses words that are commonly/frequently used in everyday life and can be changed/updated easily according to the teacher’s needs. The students will be at ease and relaxed because we don’t force them to speak, but encourage them to speak so that we know the students can understand the stories. Stories provide the grammatical structures that should be seen mainly as formulaic expressions which do not get grammatical analysis but which can be learnt in an ongoing way because they appear frequently in stories in appropriate contexts (Zaro and Salabery, 1995). Stories are memorable (Ellis and Brewster, 1991). Therefore, it can help the student’s spelling memorization practice while reading the story together with the teacher. Storytelling sparks curiosity because it makes the students wonder about what may happen next in the stories (Zaro and Salabery, 1995). If the students already know the content of a story (maybe in English or bahasa), they can use that prior
knowledge to deal with vocabulary that is more complex (e.g. words that the students never heard before).

The use of song is less effective because in song, some of the vocabulary and language used in traditional and popular English songs can cause difficulties for the students due to their use of low frequency and archaic words (Millington, 2011). So, song and the lyrics need to be selected carefully according to the target vocabulary. Other weaknesses of the song are: it is difficult for teachers to find and select songs that are suitable both in terms of vocabulary and topic/theme (Millington, 2011). Teachers need to consider the repertoire, theme/topic according to the context, and the most important thing is ear-catching tune to make student interested in singing the song. In addition, there are other difficulties placed on the teacher. According to Page in her article, while some children love to sing, others may become shy and withdraw due to intimidation. The teacher needs to play or model the song for them and review the lyrics before having them attempt it themselves. The teacher needs to convince the class to sing along with the teacher so that the learning process can happen. Therefore, song does promote mastery in vocabulary, but it is better to use storytelling first before song in order to make the children comfortable with the teacher.

Considering the elementary school students as the students with high curiosity and playfulness, it will be more interesting for them to brainstorm and share their background knowledge then discuss together among the students. Therefore, storytelling is better because in storytelling, the students can share their background knowledge and by using background knowledge, the students can understand the story easily.
CONCLUSION

Based on the hypothesis testing, the results of the study show that, (1) there is a significant difference in vocabulary mastery between the students taught using storytelling and those taught using song and (2) storytelling is more effective to be applied in teaching vocabulary than song for elementary school students to the fourth grade students of SD Patra Mandiri Cilacap in the academic year of 2015/2016.

Based on the research findings, it can be summarized that storytelling is an effective method in teaching vocabulary to the fourth grade students of SD Patra Mandiri Cilacap in the academic year of 2015/2016.

The use of storytelling is proved as an effective method to teach vocabulary. It implies that the implementation of storytelling in the teaching vocabulary gives good contribution to the development of the teaching-learning activities. It means that storytelling is a method that can be applied effectively to improve students’ vocabulary mastery.

Based on the researcher’s experience in doing the research, the researcher would like to give some suggestions as follows: (1) the teacher should use storytelling to teach vocabulary mastery; (2) the teacher should encourage the students to open up and participate in the lesson; (3) the teacher should make sure that the students know that learning English can be fun; (4) learning vocabulary through storytelling helps the students develop a curiosity on the subject and gets the students interested in learning more about it.

The result of the study merely confirms the hypothesis; it does not prove that something is absolutely true all the time. The researcher can give suggestion to other researchers that this research can be used as a consideration to enrich their references in improving vocabulary mastery by using storytelling.
**BIBLIOGRAPHY**


Millington, 2011. *Using Songs Effectively to Teach English to Young Learners*.


