

# CHALLENGES OF PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP IN HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT OF TEXTILE AND TEXTILE PRODUCTS

Irene Helvetikasari<sup>1)</sup>, Ismi Dwi Astuti Nurhaeni<sup>2)</sup>, Didik G. Suharto<sup>3)</sup>

<sup>1)2)3)</sup>Masters Program in Public Administration Department, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia

## Abstract

The impact of economic globalization and the era of industrialization is increasingly fierce competition in various economic activities, especially in the industrial sector. The development of the industrial sector also depends on human resources as one of the influential production factors. Human resource development is needed so that human resources emerge that have good technical, theoretical, moral and conceptual abilities. The presence of qualified human resources will be very influential in the process of achieving organizational goals. In order to realize an increase in industrial productivity and contribution to the economy, the government is obliged to assist in the provision of skilled industrial labour and in accordance with industrial needs. This article discusses the challenges of implementing public private partnerships in the provision of human resources carried out by AK-Tekstil Solo and the Textile Industry Partners. The main thrust of this article is that there is still a gap in the competency and soft skills of graduates of AK-Tekstil Solo. Data collection was carried out in two stages, first collecting initial data through documentation and observation. The next step is to deepen the statement and data, the researcher conducts in-depth interviews. Data analysis technique that used is flow model analysis techniques by Miles and Huberman. The results show that the challenges in implementing public-private partnerships in the development of human resources in the textile and textile products industries are teaching quality; access and equity; and governance and management. Suggestions and strategies that can be done are improving the capacity of the teaching staff, expanding access and increasing coordination among stakeholders.

**Keyword:** Public Private Partnership, Industrial Human Resources, Textiles and Textile Products

## INTRODUCTION

The impact of economic globalization and the era of industrialization has brought changes, namely the increasing level of competition in the production of goods and services. The impact that can be felt most is the increasingly fierce competition in various economic activities, especially in the industrial sector. The domestic textile and textile products (TTP) industry sector is one of the priority sectors to develop to make a significant contribution to the national economy. The export results of the textile industry and textile products are increasing every year. When viewed from the bar diagram below, that the number of exports of textiles and textile products continues to increase to reach 13.8 billion USD in 2018. This shows that there has been a significant development in the textile and textile products sector.

The textile and textile products industry is an export-oriented labour-intensive sector which is targeted to grow around 1.6-1.8% in 2017 or increase compared to 2016 which reached 1.2% (Ministry of Industry, 2017). The textile industry, judged by the government, can be a social safety net by absorbing workers. In January to May 2017, absorbed as many as 2.69 million workers in the TTP sector or 17.03% of the total workforce in the manufacturing industry. The industrial sector requires competent human resources in order to establish competitive advantage and have competitiveness with other countries' industrial sectors. The industrial sector requires competent human resources in order to establish competitive advantage and have competitiveness with other countries' industrial sectors. Human resources are one of the important factors that cannot be separated from an organization, both government institutions and companies. In essence, human resources in the form of humans are employed in an organization as a driver to achieve its goals. HR is also a determinant of the company's development.

Based on the conditions of the TTP industry, increasing competitiveness is a key word that must be considered so that the national textile industry can increase its existence both in the domestic and international markets. One of the obstacles to increasing industrial competitiveness and productivity is labour that has not been certified according to their expertise, which can hinder development and productivity in the textile industry sector. As one form of mental revolution implementation, the government through the Ministry of Industry encourages the improvement of human resource capacity through training to provide ready-to-use labour force and improve human resource capabilities in the textile industry.

HR development is very necessary for the progress of a company. HR development also plays an important role too, because development itself has the aim to develop the abilities and skills of workers and employees who will indeed be useful for their work in the future. The HR development model must be oriented to demand driven or based on labor market needs. In addition to the demands of office or job, human resource development is also carried out because it follows the times and technological advancements that are increasing day by day.

HR development is usually known as a form of the educational process carried out over a long or long period of time. The development of human resources is a process for development and expediting human expertise through the development and training of organizational personnel and the development is aimed at improving organizational performance (Steers, 2011: 4-5). Education must be in line with technological progress and work-oriented world which produces competent graduates.

Public-private partnerships (PPPs) describe government services or private business ventures that are funded and operated through government partnerships and one or more private sector companies. This scheme is sometimes referred to as PPP (Johnson, 2010).

One of the government's choices is to conduct a public private partnership with the industrial world. The government chooses the type of PPP that is present in vocational training (eg dual TVET systems) and in universities (eg transfer of knowledge with the industrial sector). The government adopted a dual system vocational training system from Germany. This model, which has gained high attractiveness from the international community, by combining apprenticeship in a company and vocational education in vocational and academic schools. For its implementation, partnerships between the government and the companies involved need to be formally established (Langthaler, 2015).

In order to implement Presidential Regulation No. 45 of 2016 concerning Government Work Plans for 2017, the Ministry of Industry implements several priority programs. One of the Ministry of Industry's priority programs is increasing industrial competitiveness and productivity. As an effort to increase the competitiveness of human resources and the high demand for competent human resources, the government and the industrial sector need to make partnerships that can produce superior human resources. To provide adequate textile education, it is necessary to provide equipment in accordance with the conditions in the industry. But there are very few or even no industrial scale equipment / machinery. On the other hand industrial-scale equipment is very expensive and requires a very large space. Industrial parties with adequate equipment and as users of textile education graduates generally object when the equipment / machinery used for production is also used as a practice tool. So that an educational institution is needed that can accommodate the creation of competent industrial workforce so that labor needs can be met, and can reduce unemployment.

The government established AK-Tekstil Solo as a college that aims to produce superior and competent human resources. The government cannot produce competent human resources if it does not get support and knows the needs of the industry. The public private partnership is established between AK-Tekstil Solo and its partners in the textile and textile products industry, which are mutually sustainable to make partnerships to create competent human resources. The partnership between AK-Tekstil Solo and industry partners has been running from 2015 to the present has experienced many challenges. The challenges faced not only come from internal AK-Textiles but also from industrial partners.

This article will discuss the challenges of public private partnerships in the development of human resources in the textile industry and textile products. The main thrust of this article is that there is still a gap in the competency and soft skills of graduates of AK-Tekstil Solo. Industry partners expect competencies and soft skills owned by graduates to be at a superior level, but in reality there are still some graduates who are not in line with expectations.

### **RESEARCH METHOD**

This study uses descriptive qualitative research methods that describe, interpret and analyze existing data. In particular, the focus of this research is on the challenges of implementing public private partnerships that will be analyzed using three aspects, namely teaching quality, access and equity and governance and management (Sterr, et al, 2015). Through these three aspects, researchers want to see how the challenges of implementing public private partnership at the Surakarta Textile and Textile Products Industry Community Academy (AK-Tekstil Solo) and the textile and textile product industry partners. Primary data is obtained directly from the informants (key person) and uses a purposive sampling technique. Interviews were conducted with directors, members of the collaboration team, external relations and promotions at the Surakarta Textile and Textile Product Industry Community Academy (AK-Tekstil Solo). Interviews were also conducted on three people from the HRD / staffing section of the textile industry and textile product partners. Interviews were conducted to analyze and discuss the challenges that arise from aspects of teaching quality, access and equality and government and management. The data validity used is source triangulation and method triangulation. Source triangulation is done by matching the consistency of the answers to the same questions from different sources. While the triangulation method is carried out by matching the results of data collection based on the same research methods (Moleong, 2009). The analysis used in this study is an interactive data analysis model presented by Miles and Huberman. The analysis is used. To obtain information that can answer questions and research objectives.

### **RESULT AND DISCUSSION**

The Ministry of Industry has the task of the President to help revitalize vocational education so that it links and matches the industrial world. One of its efforts is to establish a special education based on skills, one of which is for the development of human resources in Central Java. AK-Tekstil Solo is a vocational college of textiles and textile products that focuses on developing human resources in accordance with industrial needs. AK-Tekstil Solo holds a second diploma vocational education (D2) which is equivalent to level 4 in the

Indonesian National Qualifications Framework (KKNI). When referring to Level 4 IQF, AK-Tekstil Solo graduates must be able to carry out specific work that is routine and in accordance with work requirements and quality standards, able to solve work problems, be able to work together, communicate and have initiatives and have been given responsibility for quality and the work of others. Graduates of AK-Tekstil Solo not only get a diploma as a graduation sign, but also are given a competency certificate from the Professional Standardization National Agency (BNSP).

Since its appearance in 2015, AK-Tekstil Solo has produced 102 graduates in 2017, and 2018 has produced 186 graduates. With no waiting period for graduates because all graduates have been absorbed entirely into the textile and garment industry, namely PT Sri Rejeki Isman, Tbk., PT Dan Liris, PT Kusumahadi Santosa, PT Pan Brothers, Tbk., PT Sinar Surya Indah Lestari, PT Bintang Asahi Textile Industry and PT Kusoema Nanda Putra. Based on data obtained from AK-Tekstil Solo partners, graduates currently occupy Middle-Down positions, namely at the level of team heads, shift heads and operators.

In addition to completing two years of education, AK-Tekstil Solo graduated from AK-Tekstil Solo, but also had to do work ties with the textile and textile products industry for three years. During this period, several graduates did not complete their work obligations for several reasons. Based on interviews and surveys conducted by researchers, graduates have not yet had the mental readiness to work stressfully from both superiors and colleagues. Some supervisors who have subordinates from AK-Tekstil complained about the attitude and lack of work spirit of graduates of AK-Tekstil Solo, so that some graduates did not fulfill their obligation to carry out work ties and chose to leave work without notice, so the company and AK-Tekstil Solo difficulty asking for accountability. Other challenges arose as a result of the increase in registrant animos from AK-Tekstil Solo, in addition to the textile industry and textile products that have not joined as work partners began to show a desire to partner and enter into cooperation agreements.

### **Teaching Quality**

The study conducted by Samani (2004) states that competence is the most important thing that the industry needs. In line with this, the research conducted by Andreas (in Samani, 2004) shows that competency is the main thing expected by industry besides honesty, discipline, communication, cooperation, and mastery of the field of study. In the research conducted by Widiyanto (2011), states that the industrial world requires workers who have knowledge, skills, skills, attitudes, and others (others) such as experience. In general, the

competency requirements needed by the workforce are divided into two major groups, namely technical skills and employability skills. Technical skills are abilities in the field of work that includes knowledge and skills, while employability skills are the ability to manage work attitude and behavior skills, which cover attitude and knowledge of the nature of work. So that learning is needed that can develop technical skills and employability skills from prospective workers.

The current learning is mostly in the form of lecturing, in the same direction, more as a Teacher Centered Learning (TCL). When attending lectures that are both theoretical and practical, students tend to listen to lectures. The learning conditions of active lecturers and passive students are of low effectiveness, and cannot develop the process of active student participation in learning (Febriana, 2017). Lecturers are the center of roles in achieving learning outcomes and achieving competencies. So that a partnership with the industrial world is needed so that the learning process is aligned with the needs of the industry.

According to Okpor & Najimu (2012) partnerships are established to bring skilled and trained workforce. Kemitraan is a clear facilitator and approach to promoting sustainable national development especially in vocational education. This can be realized if the world of education wants to establish relations between the private sector and the public sector to effectively partner as well as those built for technical vocational education. Private sector partnerships in education are tools for achieving development in a country especially in the education sector to prepare and develop skills in improving human resources through work education and training.

Vocational education is an educational program that prepares people to enter the workforce, both formal and non-formal (Walter in Kuswana, 2013). When viewed from the above understanding, what is desired to be achieved from the process of vocational education is graduates who have a certain level of skills so that they are ready to enter the world of work and industry. So that the curriculum applied to vocational education especially vocational higher education is designed differently from education in general. Because vocational higher education is more focused on training students with specific occupational skills, so that the learning system teaching material in vocational higher education is more emphasized on things that are practical or majority that are related to psychomotor aspects. Vocational higher education also practices more in the learning process. In addition, in order to maximize and carry out quality assurance and quality of graduates, vocational higher education has as early as possible brought students closer to the world of work and the

industrial world through several programs that have been designed in the learning system for a certain period.

The partnership between the government and the private sector in the field of vocational higher education that links and matches the world of the textile industry is expected to reduce unemployment, meet the needs of the textile industry workforce and increase industrial productivity through a competent workforce. According to some informants, there are still obstacles that are often faced by vocational higher education including the occurrence of competency gaps between graduates and competencies that are needed by the world of work, so that an intense and strong partnership is needed between stakeholders. According to the Innovative Strategies for Accelerated Human Resource Development in South Asia issued by the Asian Development Bank, the challenge of implementing vocational higher education that establishes partnerships with the industrial world is the quality of teaching, because it impacts on the competency gaps of graduates produced. Based on the results of the study that there is still a shortage of instructors, and qualified lecturers according to the technical fields of expertise needed, so the quality of teaching becomes less good. In addition, the quality of teaching can be improved if instructors and lecturers are given capacity building facilities. Based on observations that there is still a lack of opportunities for training to improve qualifications and self-quality. Researchers also found that the involvement of experienced trainers and instructors from industry was inadequate. The researchers also found that opportunities for students in practice in the industry were limited to increasing practical skills. Students are not given the flexibility to explore their technical abilities.

When viewed from a number of problems that arise as a result of public private partnership between state-owned vocational higher education and the world of the textile industry and textile products, everything starts from the quality of teaching. If the quality of teaching provided by internal instructors and industrial instructors is in accordance with the required standards of skills qualifications, the graduates produced will be competent and in accordance with industry needs. If skills are not taught correctly, acquisition of skills will not be effective. The quality of teaching is very influential on the output of graduates produced.

### **Access And Equity**

Education is one indicator in the development and quality of human resources, because the quality of human resources depends on the quality of education. Education is a very important and strategic field in national development, because it is one of the determinants of the progress of a nation. Education is even the most effective means of

improving the quality of life and the degree of welfare of the people, and that can lead to a nation achieving prosperity. Until now Indonesia still faces the main obstacles in efforts to improve the quality of education is the problem of the lack of costs and facilities used. Quality education is one of the goals of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). So that education in Indonesia is now expected to be heading for a better direction. With SDG's expected education in Indonesia will also experience educational equity including equality (equality of opportunity to obtain education) and equity (fairness in obtaining educational opportunities). Access to education is called evenly distributed if all school-age residents have had the opportunity to enjoy education and are called fair if groups within the community can enjoy education equally.

According to the research that conducted by Effendy (2014) education and technical and vocational training focuses primarily on only men. The phenomenon of gender inequality in the field of education in Indonesian society is still very strong. In many families in Indonesia, girls are not a top priority for education. In vocational education there is a stereotype that women do not fit into vocational education that leads to technology. Research conducted by Sulaiman et al. (2017) states that many school-age women choose vocational education in engineering, but do not make it a profession, because many Engineering jobs do not provide equal rights and opportunities for women. In this study it was found that 72% of the students were male and only about 28% were female chose study programs related to large-scale textile machinery.

Based on observations made by researchers, students at AK-Tekstil Solo are not currently from low-income families, students are still found with sufficient financial ability to study at the AK-Tekstil Solo. Even though at the beginning of its establishment it was hoped that the scholarships provided by the government could touch low-income communities so that they could improve living standards and reduce poverty. The absence of provisions that bind and require prospective students to come from low-income households also causes the program not to target there. Lack of information for low income households regarding the existence of government programs on scholarships and industrial work ties.

The challenges faced in the partnership between AK-Tekstil Solo as a government agency and industry in terms of implementing vocational education in the field of textiles are opportunities and equal rights for male and female students in relation to work placements and equal opportunities when work placements are done in the industry. In addition, access from low-income communities to access scholarship programs is still limited. Lack of information and socialization especially in low income communities.

### **Governance And Management**

Philosophically, vocational education has three kinds of objectives, namely: (1) essentialism, (2) pragmatic, and (3) pragmatic reconstruction. The purpose of vocational education in terms of essentialism is to meet the needs of the labour market marked by a curriculum held sequentially, instructors need to have extensive industry-related experience. The system is separate from academic education. The purpose of vocational education in terms of pragmatic is to meet the individual needs for personal fulfilment and preparation for life which is characterized by an emphasis on problem solving and higher level thinking, learning is built on prior knowledge. In addition, the purpose of vocational education in terms of reconstruction pragmatism is to transform work into a more democratic, more proactive, fight injustice and inequality in work problems (Rojewski, 2009: 22). Often the objectives of vocational education cannot be carried out because there is no support from the government. Like administrative administration which is often difficult.

The government is tasked with serving the implementation of all types of education, including vocational education and vocational higher education to produce productive graduates who want to work or who want to become productive and independent entrepreneurs. The main objective of vocational education is to produce productive economic actors; creative workers, and independent entrepreneurs (MONE, 2005). Vocational higher education cannot be separated from national economic programs, as well as business and industry as "work recipients". The business world and industry at any time need skilled workers, experts, and professionals in perspective as economic actors. The success of vocational education is not measured by diplomas, but is measured from the users' perspective, such as: employment capacity, productivity level, career advancement, and graduate income.

The government as the state organizer through the technical institutions under it needs to coordinate systemically with the holders of national economic policies and programs, as well as with the business world and industry. The government needs to take a more intensive approach to the industry, because with the presence of the MEA, foreign workers can more easily enter Indonesia. Moreover, foreign workers are considered to have better qualifications than Indonesian workers. The government is obliged to protect employment opportunities from Indonesian workers, by increasing and increasing capacity building programs for productive age communities. Enhancing technical capabilities for labour-intensive industrial fields such as textiles and food.

The concept of vocational education needs to be expanded not only to hold vocational formal education but also to hold various types of short courses or training that are deliberately formed to meet market needs (demand driven), as well as recognition of prior learning such as: continuing education, continuous professional education, as well as various forms of community colleges, such as AK-Tekstil Solo. With the expansion of education, it is expected that labour needs can be met and no foreign workers are needed.

### CONCLUSION

The impact of economic globalization and the era of industrialization has brought changes, namely the increasing level of competition in the production of goods and services. The textile and textile products industry is an export-oriented labour-intensive sector that requires a lot of skilled labour. Fulfilment of skilled workforce is carried out with vocational education programs that implement it through public private partnership with the industrial world. The challenges faced in implementing public private partnerships in the development of human resources in textiles and textile products are teaching quality, access and equity and governance and management. Suggestions that can be given by researchers are strategies that can be used to answer the challenges of teaching quality is to increase technical skills and soft skills from teachers, so that they can transfer capabilities and update the latest capabilities according to technological developments. While the strategy used to answer the challenges of governance and management is to strengthen integration and coordination. One of the main challenges in implementing a labour market oriented education system involves the development of a coordinated governance system in which the central government and stakeholders. For the challenge of access and equity that must be done by all stakeholders is to expand access and prioritize low income people.

### REFERENCE

- Andrew ,Cathy; Cindy Howe; John Kane; Reese Mattison. (2007) Dynamic Korea; Education Policies and Reform. *Group Projec* 50(3)
- Asian Development Bank. (2017) Innovative strategies for Accelerated human resource Development in south asia-Public private partnerships For education and training : Special Focus on Bangladesh, Nepal, and SriLanka.
- Badan Pusat Statistik (2008) Survey Sosial Ekonomi Nasional, Jakarta BPS
- Depdiknas, (2005) "Rencana Strategis Pembangunan Pendidikan Nasional 2005-2009., Jakarta Sekretariat Jenderal Depdiknas
- Efendy,Rustan. ( 2014). Kesetaraan Gender Dalam Pendidikan . *Jurnal Al-Maiyyah*, 7(02) : 142-165
- Fabrice Henard and Soleine Leprince-Ringuet.(2008). The Path To Quality Teaching In Higher Education.

- Febriana, Rina.(2017). Efektivitas Model Pembelajaran Berbasis Kompetensi Dengan Pendekatan Dunia Kerja Pada Program D3 Tata Boga . *Cakrawala Pendidikan.*, XXXVI (1) : 148-155
- Johnson, W (2010) Public Enterprises, engine of development, *International Journal of Sustainable Development*, 4(2) 51-59
- Kuswana, Sunaryo, wowo, 2013. Dasar-dasar Pendidikan Vokasi & Kejuruan. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Langthaler, M. (2015). The transfer of the Austrian dual system of vocational education to transition and developing countries: An analysis from a developmental perspective. No 53
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. 2009. Analisis Data Kualitatif. Jakarta: UI Press World Bank, Asian Development Bank and Inter-American Development Bank. (2014). *Public-Private Partnership Reference Guide Version 2.0*. Washington: The World Bank Publications
- Rojewski.,J.W. (2009). *A conceptual framework for technical and vocational education and training*. Germany: Springer Science Bussines Media.
- Samani, Muchlas. (2004). *Pendidikan kecakapan hidup: Upaya merekonstruksi pendidikan*. Makalah.Disajikan dalam seminar dan lokakarya bidang peningkatan relevansi program DUE-LIKE”, Jurusan Pendidikan Fisika IKIP Negeri Singaraja tanggal 15-16 Agustus, di Singaraja.
- Steers, Richard M. (2011). *Efektifitas Organisasi*. Erlangga, Jakarta.
- Sulaiman, Nor Lisa; Kahirol Mohd Salleh; Mimi Mohaffyza Mohamad & Lai Chee. (2015). Technical and Vocational Education in Malaysia: Policy, Leadership, and Professional Growth on Malaysia Women. *Asian Social Science* 11(24): 153-161
- Widiyanto. (2011). “Peranan Kompetensi Pekerja Terhadap Kebutuhan Industri Untuk Meningkatkan Daya Saing Perusahaan. *Jurnal Pendidikan Eksplanasi*, 6(1): 94-108.